STORIES OF TEACHERS’ IDENTITY: BETWEEN PERSONAL AND PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE

KATEŘINA LOJDOVÁ,
KATEŘINA VLČKOVÁ,
JAN NEHYBA

Abstract
Teacher identity is one of the key factors influencing the form and quality of educational processes. The aim of our literature review is an analysis of research on teachers’ narrative identity in primary and secondary education. We used the Web of Science database and selected studies from 2010–2020 in English. The analysis shows that the area of teacher identity can be viewed from the points of personal and professional identity and their interplay. The data about teacher identity were collected mostly as narratives showing teachers’ experience of their profession and their selves. Professional identity is investigated in terms of diversity in classroom discourse, curriculum, and professional development. Research on a teachers’ personal identity focuses primarily on gender, parenting, sexual orientation, ethnicity, culture, political orientation, and national identity. The study illustrates an interplay of professional and personal identity.

Keywords
teacher identity, professional identity, personal identity, narratives
Teacher identity is formed and reformed by the stories teachers tell and that they draw upon in their communications with others (Beijaard et al., 2004). Connelly and Clandinin (1999) developed the narrative term “stories to live by,” referring to “a narrative way of thinking about teacher identity [that] speaks to the nexus of teachers’ personal practical knowledge and the landscapes, past and present, on which teachers live and work.” The temporality of individuals’ experiences combined with the social networks in which they have worked and lived shape who they are and who they are becoming (Schaefer & Clandinin, 2019).

Based on these premises, we decided to analyze the personal and professional landscapes of teachers’ identities as portrayed in their narratives. The goal of this study is to review current research on narratively constructed identity by teachers. This study reveals “stories to live by which denote teacher identity” (Li et al., 2019, p. 293) and thus contributes to the special issue answering the question of how identities of teachers are constructed, specifically in personal interactions and professional interactions, including staffroom interactions.

**Teacher identity in narrative construction**

With respect to narrative studies, we focus on identity as a social construct; however, this approach has taken a number of different routes (cf. de Finna, 2003). We chose to examine narrative identity based on a research project focused on narrative identities in alternative education (footnote 1). Ricoeur’s (1991) use of the adjective “narrative” enriched the analytical approach to identity. In our research project, we rely on the concept of narrative identities as more situational or “episodic” (Holler & Klepper, 2013), and we examine them in relation to teachers. Identity is not a single stabilized entity that teachers acquire at some point in life; instead, one might enact distinct identities throughout various stages of life and through the disparate contexts one traverses (Park & Schallert, 2018) or even through dialogues during different situations within a day (Akkerman & Meijer, 2011). Identity is an ongoing process, and it changes its form (Alsup, 2006; Beijaard et al., 2004). Thus, teacher identity is dynamic, multifaceted, negotiated, and co-constructed (Edwards & Burns, 2016), as are the identities of other participants in education. While identity has been conceptualized differently, “what these various meanings have in common is the idea that identity is not a fixed attribute of a person, but a relational phenomenon” (Beijaard et al., 2004, p. 108). “Narrative approach to identity shows that teacher identity derives from the sociocultural orientation, emphasizing the multiplicity, discontinuity and social nature of identity” (Schutz et al., 2018, p. 186). When focusing on life in schools, the situational aspect of teacher identity plays a role.
If researchers take into account the situational aspect of identities, they usually assume that the main focus should be to observe how the participants in interaction are oriented toward one another and one another’s categories “here and now” (Törrönen, 2014). A lifelong series of these “here and now” moments construct a teacher’s lived experience and could be investigated narratively.

Identity is constructed in interactions; it is also constructed narratively in teacher speech referring to these interactions. Narrative identity might be conceptualized as a co-construction of reality (cf. Riessman, 1993). Emerging research on teacher identity in the last two decades is shifting from the traditional notion of teachers as professionals who acquire predefined professional standards to teachers as whole persons and agents who make sense of themselves and their teaching practices (Korthagen, 2001). Current research focuses on aspects of teacher identity constructed in their narratives such as gender or subject matter. There is a lack of synthesizing research. Therefore, our analysis leads to an overview on professional and personal teacher identities constructed in teacher narratives as these identities impact student learning (Schutz et al., 2018).

Methods

The research question for the literature review was: What factors influence the identity of teachers in published narrative research from 2010 to 2020?

For the literature review, the Web of Science (WoS) database was used, and research studies in English from 2010 to 2020 were collected. The keywords narrative research AND identity were entered in combination with AND education (area 1), AND teachers (area 1), AND directors/principals (area 2), AND pupils/students/learners (area 3), AND parents (area 4). Due to the large number of resources, we subsequently focused only on narrative research of teachers in primary and secondary education. The teachers’ identities were not specified as only for private schools or for the Czech Republic, but for education in general.

---

1 This review study of teachers’ identities is a part of our research on Narrative identities of participants in education at private alternative schools (project No. GA20-12828S) funded by the Czech Science Foundation, in which we map the identities of participants in Czech alternative education within the area of narrative research. In that project, we focus on the narrative research of teachers, student teachers, school principals, pupils, and parents.
A total of 558 studies from a direct search on the given keywords *narrative research* AND *identity* AND *teachers* were found, and another 174 studies were found with the keywords *teacher identity* AND *narrative*. From these studies, 470 studies were excluded after the title and abstract were examined. Studies were included that reported on teachers focused on primary and secondary education. Studies focusing on teachers in pre-primary and tertiary education, on teachers in their pre-service phase, and on educators outside of the context of formal education were excluded (see Figure 1). In terms of the pre-service phase, studies about in-service teachers referring to their pre-service phase were included. Studies that did not discuss the identity of the teachers were excluded. Some, for example, discussed the identity of other actors in education, such as students. In total, 262 full texts of studies were read, and 87 studies were analyzed in detail.

The research studies were qualitative; the keyword *qualitative* was found in 28 abstracts. In terms of research methods, the keyword “interview” was found in 62 abstracts. The aims of these studies were mostly to explore how teachers negotiate their identity: explore professional identity development”; “negotiate identity”; “examine lived experiences”, “provide insights into teachers journeys”; “investigate second/foreign language teachers’ translingual identity development”; “explore cultural knowledge and lived experience in pedagogical practice”; “describe memory and life story process engaged in by teachers”. The studies also investigated the effects of phenomena on teacher identity and teachers: “investigate the effects that a changing world and precarious job conditions can have on newly qualified teachers’ sense of engagement”; “analyze training implications”; and “investigate emotional demands on teachers.”

Factors forming the identity of teachers were extracted from the analyzed studies. These factors were then divided into two categories: professional and personal. “Professional” refers to the professional career of teachers. These factors are exclusive for the teaching profession, e.g., classroom discourse or professional development of teachers. “Personal” factors are factors not directly linked to the teaching profession, such as gender, ethnicity, or parenting experience.
Stories of professional identity

Stories of professional identity consist of teachers’ narratives focused on their professional lives. Teacher identity is formed through integrating a number of sub-identities flowing from different working contexts and professional relationships. Teachers tell stories about their professional life and themselves within this context. In this chapter, classroom discourse appears to be an important source of teachers’ narrative identity, followed by curriculum matters; finally, the phase of professional development is mirrored in teachers’ narratives.
Diversity in classroom discourse portrayed in teachers’ stories

The call for papers of this monothematic issue of *Studia paedagogica* cites Foucault’s assumption that social phenomena are constructed from within discourses. We would like to start with classroom discourse as an area in which teachers construct their identity in their narratives. Teacher identities are multiple, fluid, and dynamic, emerging in interactions in one important discursive space of their lives: the classrooms where they converse with students (Juzwik & Ives, 2010). In the critical education perspective, classroom discourse includes issues related to social justice such as the ideas of equitable redistribution and knowledge (Salvador & Kelly-McHale, 2017).

Classroom diversity is an important issue within the classroom discourse, as our review revealed. In their narratives, teachers may express problematic issues of student diversity in relationship to their own professional identity. Wagner and Hu (2020) showed that teachers found that the diversification of Luxembourg society led to diverse classrooms. This classroom diversification was linked to a fear of marginalization—that by giving other cultures and languages too much importance and space, it was possible to lose one’s own cultural traditions and thus identity. Thus, these teachers’ identity was connected with their own cultural traditions. In fact, classroom diversity might be a transformative power for teacher identity. In their narratives, teachers refer to their students’ otherness (racial, socioeconomic, sexual orientation), which leads to a naming Self-Other relationship. Thus, through the diversity of their students, teachers think about themselves. Diversity requires Self–Other transformation, especially in the field of emotions. In order to teach, teachers need to understand the emotions that support their identity and the identity of their students. Keith (2010) explained that black and white racial identity in schools revealed different emotional paths that must be taken before people can understand themselves and one another. Another category that the teachers in the research by Wagner and Hu (2020) used to differentiate among themselves and their students was their sociocultural background. They referred to the social environments of their students to explain their behavior and their performance at school. The investigated teachers relied on concepts of identity and culture. They established a specific connection between the development of identity and the fact of being rooted in a cultural and linguistic tradition (Wagner & Hu, 2020).

In the reviewed studies, we can identify the interplay between racial identity and teachers’ commitments to social justice. Racial identity is defined as the significance and qualitative meaning that individuals attribute to their membership within a racial group (Livingston et al., 2020). Regarding teachers’ black identity, in the narrative of a black teacher in a southwestern U.S. urban middle school by Zhu (2020), the teacher improved her students’ academic performance by confirming the funds of their identities — she brought her
students’ community cultural wealth, such as rap, police brutality, immigration, and legal issues, into her classroom. In examining the relationship between racial identity and classroom discourse, Zhu (2020) suggested that this black teacher’s story could inspire more urban teachers to reflect on their professional identities and repertoires of instruction; for instance, this teacher’s culturally responsive pedagogy might act as a powerful lens through which urban teachers could examine sociopolitical discourses contributing to the “achievement debt.”

Classroom diversity may be a challenge for the construction of teacher identity where the racial and sociocultural contexts of teachers and students differ; on the other hand it may be a source of justice-oriented pedagogy, by drawing on students’ community cultural wealth, funds of knowledge, and funds of identity in teaching where the racial and sociocultural identity of teachers and students is close.

Student disabilities represent other fields of classroom diversity. Franklin (2017) focused on a disability-as-deficit model that labels those students who receive special education services as somehow less, as outside the norm, as others. In his autoethnographic exploration, he explores the intersection of sibling (a brother he has with Down syndrome) and special educator knowledge. He explains how his teacher knowledge creates his identity differently than the identity of his colleagues. Inclusive education is brought into practice through teacher identity. Naraian (2016) discovered a dilemma in interviews with teacher educators in the U.S. working towards inclusion: should they consider themselves special educators, inclusive educators, or general educators – or all three? This study disclosed that learning needs formed the pivot around which educators established their sense of competence and professional self-worth, thereby reinforcing the boundaries for different kinds of learning spaces.

Classroom diversity in terms of LGBTQ students was researched by Smith (2018). Teachers used the phrase “all students” as a mechanism to include LGBTQ students in their professional narratives without naming them and their particular needs.

The classroom diversity issues discussed are manifested within classroom discourse and seem to be a vital force for teacher identity construction.

_in terms of curriculum and subject matter, teachers of science (Lutovac & Kaasila, 2019; Murphy et al., 2017; Novelli & Ross, 2017), physical education (Fadale & Powell, 2017; Landi, 2018), arts (Kraehe, 2015) and most of all second languages (EFL) have been researched (Ahn, 2019; Anjea, 2016; Avalos-Rivera, 2019; Lieva, 2010; Liu & Xu, 2013; Loo, 2018; Pennington, 2016; Raman & Yiğitoğlu, 2018; Torres-Rocha, 2017; Trent, 2017; Wolf & de Costa, 2017). Although we studied many papers in this category, in terms of our
research project based on the field of humanities and an extensive body of literature in this field, we illustrate only the example of languages in this article. It is not a coincidence that language teachers have been researched in terms of their identity, partly because research into teacher identity has found that identities are performed through a combination of language features (Poole, 2020). According to Pennington and Richards (2016), a person’s identity as a language teacher relates to the person’s language background and language proficiency. For EFL teachers, transnationalism seems to have been paramount to enacting identities. For example, in the life stories of teachers who have experienced migration moves between Mexico and the U.S., while living in the U.S., a teacher seemed to be well aware that it was important to preserve his Spanish language; when he decided to leave the U.S., he made an effort to maintain social, cultural, and linguistic connections with the U.S. to preserve the transnational identity he had constructed as a result of his passages in both contexts (Mora Vázquez et al., 2018). Also, the subject and content of instruction, the methods and approaches to teaching, and the students and specific context in which one teaches are important factors influencing teacher identity (Pennington & Richards, 2016). As for students, the narrative analysis of an English teacher by Avalos-Rivera (2019) revealed that students played an important role in his professional identity negotiations. He presented his ability to construct a friendly relationship with his students as essential in legitimizing his position as a teacher. Construction of teacher identity in curricular conversations with students in the classroom is vital, but identity is also constructed in other social spaces (e.g., teachers’ staffroom, lunchroom conversations with colleagues, research interviews) where curriculum might be a topic (Juzwik & Ives, 2010).

Identity also depends on whether the teacher is a native speaker or a nonnative speaker. For native speakers, accent matters. In the research by Aneja (2016), one of the teachers mentioned that “British accents were fashionable in China decades ago and American accents are becoming increasingly common and Australian is definitely no good.” Identity is co-constructed with other sub-identities, such as race, socioeconomic class, and country of origin. This complicates the native–nonnative dichotomy (Aneja, 2016). A teacher’s identity as a nonnative English speaker in a study by Avalos-Rivera (2019) clashed with some of his students who, thanks to their privileged access to cultural capital, had experienced English in ways that the teacher perceived as superior to his own. To compensate for this power differential, the teacher attributed his success in neutralizing student hostility to his participation in a competition in which he positioned himself as a leader. Therefore, in this teacher’s story, his professional identity was successfully negotiated as he engaged in relevant social practices with his students. These practices, although not connected to English teaching, allowed the teacher to gain his students’ respect.
In the narrative research of EFL teachers in China by Poole (2020), there was tension between Chinese and English professional identity, conveyed in the frequent use of the conjunction ‘but’ in the researched teacher’s narratives. In this case, the teacher’s decision to enter the teaching profession was based on strong personal reasons rather than a more pragmatic decision to teach English for its perceived symbolic capital. Reasons for entering the profession may play a role in teacher identity construction, not only in second language teachers.

Rahimi and Bigdeli (2014) interviewed EFL teachers in Iran. The results revealed nine role identities: teacher as vendor, teacher as entertainer, teacher as motivator, teacher as expert, teacher as learner, teacher as socializer, teacher as reflective practitioner, and teacher as collaborator. It was also revealed that participants invested in the role identities that were supported by positive feedback from others. The role of others is crucial for teacher identity; positive feedback for teacher identity construction was also found by Trent (2017).

Teacher identity interplays with teaching practice. For foreign language teachers, code switching might be an example. Raman and Yiğitoğlu (2018) found that teachers were taking multiple identity positions when justifying their code-switching practices, i.e. their personal identities, non-native English teacher identities, language learner identities, and linguistic identities. Qin (2019) examined how curriculum became a resource for identity in one ESL classroom. The ESL teacher narrated her journey into teaching as an instructional example and performed a dominating teacher identity rhetorically portrayed in a morally positive light.

In spite of the fact that classroom context is more important than school context for a teacher’s identity construction (Juzwik & Ives, 2010), the broader educational context also matters. Educational reform seems an influencing factor for teacher identity. Turvey et al. (2012) described a standards-based reform experienced by teachers and their students in connection to the identity of both. As for teachers, Wee Teo (201) captured a schoolteacher who described the curriculum reform as “walking a tight rope.” De Villiers (2016) introduced educational reform and the way that the new school curriculum served as an impetus for professional development for teachers.

Identity construction within a Catholic school in Australia shows how school context matters (Sultmann & Brown, 2019). However more focused on curriculum reform itself, Liu and Xu (2011) examined the complexity of teacher identity in the broader context of a reform in which teachers had to reconcile conflicting selves. Bechard (2017) captured the autobiographical narrative of identity shift caused by transformative moments in international teacher travel experiences in sociopolitical changes in context, especially demographic shifts, with increasingly diverse learners, curricular mandates, high-stakes accountability, technological advancements, and globalization. As the educational environment evolves, so must teacher identities.
Although focused only on EFL teachers, several areas of identity construction in teachers emerged that could also be found in other subject matters. Avraamidou (2014) synthesized the findings of 29 empirical studies on teacher identity within the field of science education. Studying teacher identity within reform recommendations, conducting life-history studies, and examining teacher identity enactment in school classrooms happened in science classrooms as well as in language classrooms. With respect to curriculum differences, teacher identity is co-constructed with different actors from the micro-social level of the classroom to the macro-social level of educational policy (e.g., educational reform).

**Professional development of teachers portrayed in teachers’ stories**

Teaching practice periods and in-service experiences appear to be highly influential for identity development (Anspal et al., 2012; Dreon & McDonald, 2012). Trent (2017) offered an in-depth analysis of the experiences of two teachers during their initial year of full-time teaching in Hong Kong schools. Teacher identity construction was captured in two very different experiences, as one teacher justified and reaffirmed her determination to pursue a career within English language teaching and the other made the decision to leave the teaching profession. The reflected positive experiences of lesson observation by the principal of the teacher who remained in the profession stand in contrast to that of the teacher who left the profession. The teacher who left rejected the principal’s preferred mode of teaching as “too boring” in contrast to his own preferred “interactive approach” to teaching. Schaefer (2013), in a study based on autobiographical narrative inquiry, showed how important the lived experiences of each individual are and how important the stories are that bring beginning teachers to the profession or lead them out of the profession. Teachers have two important stories: “stories to live by” and “stories to leave by,” which are associated with leaving or staying at the school (Schaefer, 2013). If the teacher stays at the school, narratives as experienced teachers or even veteran teachers develop.

One important topic in the phases of teacher development is the stage of novice or beginner teacher identity (Craig, 2014). Novice teachers often undergo an identity shift from learner to teacher. Novice teachers in the study by Huang et al. (2019) experienced four processes related to their beliefs in their teaching work: 1) confirmation, during which the novice teachers strengthened their prior beliefs, 2) realization, which refers to the process during which the novice teachers became more fully aware of or developed a new belief in teaching, 3) disagreement, which took place when the novice teachers rejected their previously held beliefs; and 4) elaboration, during which
the novice teachers deepened and expanded their existing beliefs by adding in new dimensions. For novice teachers, the gap between theory/beliefs and practice is often discussed. Schatz-Oppenheimer & Dvir (2014) showed how to help resolve the gap between fantasy and the professional reality of novice teachers, which is how “stories to live by” are supported. Golombek and Klager (2015) showed how imagining different perspectives in teaching is a way to support the creation of a new identity for a novice teacher. Another important way to support “stories to live by” is to support a beginning teacher’s identity through diverse emotionally significant relationships in the micropolitical context of the school (Uitto et al., 2015b) or institutional support in providing opportunities (Huang et al., 2019). Former teachers or mentors seems to be crucial for novice teachers’ construction of identity. In their written narratives, almost all 342 teachers in one study (Cardelle-Elawar & de Acedo Lizarraga, 2010) mentioned former teachers as a source of inspiration and role models to imitate in their current classroom practices.

In a longitudinal study, Barkhuizen (2016) investigated the imagined identities of an English teacher in New Zealand in the pre-service phase and compared these with the identities she had negotiated in her teaching practice nearly nine years later. During her teaching practicum, she was mistaken for a cleaner in the kitchen because of her Pacific Island (Tongan) appearance. This incident is what she remembers most about her practicum experience. The change of identity in this case is shifted from a desire to teach immigrants to teaching mainly white and international students in a privileged school in a high socioeconomic suburb of Auckland.

Another challenge for novice teachers might be educational reform, as the story of a young teacher by Liu and Xu (2011) revealed. The teacher felt “included in” and “excluded from” the community; the authors showed how this teacher coped with an identity crisis in the midst of educational reform. This research created a portrait of a teacher's identity experience in, through, and beyond the community. The story recounted a critical incident that led to the teacher leaving the community.

As for practicing teachers, Kauppinen et al. (2020) found in their narrative research that in-service training plays a role in the construction of professional identity. The education program for in-service teachers affected the pedagogical thinking and professional orientation of all participating teachers in some way. In the narratives, the teachers’ identities were transformed or strengthened mainly by the adoption of new or cultivated ways of planning, implementing, and evaluating innovations in instruction. In contrast, only small changes emerged in the teachers’ pedagogical mindset and professional orientation. These teachers could not rid themselves of the various defenses that regulated their actions both in the education program and in the classroom (Kauppinen et al., 2020).
In-service training may have different landscapes, such as the teacher-scientist partnership in the western U.S. (Giamellaro et al., 2020). The teachers were at first the learners and then became the teachers/narrators. Even though the teachers highly valued their experiences with the scientists, they generally did not bring them back to the classroom as independent stories. In this case, the teachers’ narratives were based heavily on the scientists’ narratives. Thus, teacher identity and teaching practices are interconnected. Another example of an in-service training landscape is that teachers who held a positive attitude toward their professional identity are more autonomous in their teaching practices than those with a negative attitude (Qian & Huang, 2019).

Educational experience is not the only significant factor for identity construction of in-service teachers. Besides learning in training courses, teachers learn through their life experiences within the schools. Public school teachers share narratives in the workplace to understand their identities in the changing educational system (Gilmore & Kramer, 2019). Conway and Hibbard (2018) focused on the micropolitical landscape of the school in teachers’ narratives. Metaphoric models were used to describe participants’ salient roles in the micropolitical landscape, sometimes defined by relationships with administrators, teachers, parents, or students.

Besides learning in the workplace, leaving the workplace for a while, especially in terms of an international experience, is also vital for a teacher’s identity and professional development. Ospina and Medina (2020) researched a group of visiting teachers in the United States in terms of the benefits from their intercultural experiences and the challenges they faced. For benefits, teachers mentioned that the visit helped them build a good rapport with students, which affects the teachers’ self-esteem. However, culturally different educational contexts also bring challenges. It appears that some school districts made efforts to support international educators by assigning a mentor, although those efforts were not structured enough to provide sufficient support and guidance to the mentees (Ospina & Medina, 2020). How the cross-cultural teaching experience of a Chinese beginning teacher in Singapore influenced the development of his professional teacher identity was captured in the narrative study by Yip et al. (2019). The main challenges to the teacher’s identity in cross-cultural teaching according to this study are: identity confusion; adjusting to the local environment, standards, and pedagogy; stress and fear.

Prout et al. (2020) explored the unique nature of narrative research in fostering intra-personal transformation of veteran teachers in Australia. The author, as an experienced teacher and teacher educator himself, revealed transformative moments for participants and for the researcher himself within narrative research, especially during moments of nonverbal communication. Narrative research seems to be a strong tool for capturing participants’ identities during their professional lives as well as the identities of the researchers.
Stories of personal teacher identity

Teacher identity, as shown in the analyzed studies, is influenced by many personal and cultural factors like gender, age, sexual orientation, parenting, ethnicity, culture and language, national identity, political orientation, religion, and emotions.

Gender portrayed in teachers’ stories

The main topic in the area of teachers’ gender identity is that women are often under-represented in secondary school headships. For example, Smith (2012) reported that a third of secondary headships were held by women in England and Wales. Based on questionnaires and interviews, she described the differences of female and male student teachers’ professional aspirations at a UK university (Smith, 2014). Whilst there was commonality in interest in subject leadership and teaching- and learning-oriented roles such as Advanced Skills Teacher, women were more likely than men to aspire to the post of Special Educational Needs Coordinator, and men were more likely to aspire to the most senior posts, especially headship. Whilst both showed awareness of the challenging aspects of management, men were more likely to perceive the advantages and to envisage themselves as headteachers. There was also a difference in the ways in which men and women constructed teaching and leadership (Smith, 2014).

Smith (2012), using life history interviews with 40 secondary school female teachers in all stages of their professional careers in the UK, looked at the main factors affecting their career decisions and drew up a typology of female teachers’ approaches to career, identifying two types: those who defined their teaching career as self-defined and planned, and those who saw their career paths as defined by external factors, where the circumstances of their lives and jobs (available opportunities, limitations, level of support from others, fate, chance events, family responsibilities, partner’s attitude, and so on) framed their decisions, and in some cases, stymied their potential progress (Smith, 2012). The external factor type of woman used passive language, compared to the self-defined type. Smith (2012) reported women’s lives as characterized by conflict and contradiction. Women negotiated life and career decisions within the limitations of their lives, both conforming to and opposing the constraints on their freedom. The ways in which they conformed or resisted varied according to the particular context of their lives. In Smith’s (2011) research, 10 head teachers spoke very positively about their roles, while the other 30 women teachers interviewed were adamant that they would not consider headship as a career option.
Smith (2012) found that the women’s rejection of headship was based for the most part on a set of perceptions of headship that discouraged them from aspiring: “It was seen as inevitable that the headship role would take teachers out of the classroom, away from children, so compromising their pupil-centered values. It was seen to require an ability to be tough, which entailed isolation and loss of popularity, and it was seen to involve dull, uninspiring work, dealing with bureaucracy and finance. Finally, it was seen to impact negatively on one’s home and family life.” Many of the women who were adamant that they would not consider headship said they would consider it if the school leadership culture were more in harmony with their values and preferred ways of working. These results show that female headship rejection is not a simple matter of lack of ambition or self-belief, as some previous studies had suggested.

Sexual orientation portrayed in teachers’ stories

Some of the most significant research about LGBTQ teachers emerged in the 1990s (e.g., Griffin, 1992; Jennings, 1994), providing nascent understandings of the conflicts that LGBTQ teachers negotiated between their personal and professional identities. The personal identity of teachers is connected to their sexual orientation, which can cause tensions, as teachers often invest much of themselves in their work, blurring boundaries between the public and private (Llewellyn & Reynolds, 2021). Many teachers share details of their lives as a way to build LGBTQ rapport with students, but this is often denied LGBTQ teachers as a “heterosexual privilege.” Many LGBTQ teachers experience pressure to be role models for young people (Neary, 2013), despite the fact that young people do not commonly look to teachers to be role models. LGBTQ teachers are particularly aware that their silence adds to the underlying heteronormativity in society (Endo et al., 2010).

Queer teachers’ identity is a substantive topic of teacher identity; we can find many articles about this topic. Endo et al. (2010) pointed out that very often queer sexual identity is separate from the teacher identity. Landi (2018) formulated some recommendations for queer physical education. Lander (2018) reported on queer English language teachers in Columbia and their image in society. Bracho and Hayes (2020) studied literature on gay teachers of color and reported that rectifying their image requires queer colored educators to examine their experiences within the intersections of race, gender, class, and other dimensions of identity.

To sum up, LGBTQ teachers often report developing strategies that protect their professional identity, one of which is building a super-teacher identity as a means of deflecting attention from their sexuality (Endo et al., 2010).
Because they are good teachers, they have not experienced any discrimination, but they fear discrimination because of potentially systemic, rather than overt, homophobia (Msibi, 2019). In their own view, they have to work harder to prove their worth and build an identity that would be difficult to criticize (Msibi, 2019). Therefore, these teachers construct the identity of a hard-working teacher to compensate for a perceived deficit in mainstream sexual orientation and a sense of difference that could lead to a devaluation of their value in the eyes of others. The super-teacher identity displays a hyper-professionalism (Llewellyn & Reynolds, 2020). As well as adopting a “super-teacher” position, further strategies include adjusting the personal information they share and the language they use (Llewellyn & Reynolds, 2021). LGBTQ teachers demonstrate agency and resistance and to some extent it is positive; however, its status primarily serves as protection against being viewed as an outsider or against expected failure.

Parenting experience portrayed in teachers’ stories

Using the example of a teacher and head teacher, Li et al. (2019) showed how his relationship to his son is mirrored in his teaching concepts. The research teacher reported that he failed to communicate with his son when he spoke with him as a parental authority and told him why he should do something. When he started treating his son as an equal being, his son shouldered his own responsibility. At that moment, the teacher felt deeply that the true meaning of education is to guide, not to control.

Importance of the culture that teachers live in portrayed in teachers’ stories

Teachers also might report the importance of the culture that they live in, including their mother tongue. Wagner and Hu (2020) interviewed one teacher in Luxemburg who elaborated the metaphor of being “rooted in a tradition” when she spoke about her own experience, highlighting that her socialization was based on strong “roots” that are fixed in a stable tradition. The repetitive use of several strong metaphors, such as “roots”, “rooted”, and “not anchored in any culture” was obvious and seemed to reflect a strong emotional involvement and a tendency to essentialize identity, language, and culture.

Ethnicity portrayed in teachers’ stories

Zhu (2020) showed how teachers build identity in minorities and a (multi) cultural context. If students have the same ethnicity as the teacher, teachers might try to emancipate students in the sense that if they managed, the students will manage as well (upwards social mobility); they focus on a caring
relationship and support minority topics in the lessons (e.g., social justice) and delimit themselves against neoliberal educational politics (Zhu, 2020).

National identity portrayed in teachers’ stories

Similarly, the importance of national identity was reported by teachers in different countries: American identity (Generett & Olson, 2020), Luxemburg identity (Wagner & Hu, 2020), and Mexican identity (Johnson, 2020).

Political orientation portrayed in teachers’ stories

Teachers’ protest became a symbol of identity along the lines of a public leftist discourse (Johnson, 2020). The politicization of teacher identity was obvious in Norway, where public narratives about teacher identity gave education policy a rather strong governing function, which Søreide (2007) called narrative control.

Role of emotions portrayed in teachers’ stories

The perception of obstacles is connected the role of emotions in teacher identity. Emotions play an important role in shaping the working lives and identity of teachers (Keith, 2010; Kirk & Wall, 2010). The emotional dimension helps create the identity of novice teachers (Uitto, 2015a); or the identity of English teachers were created through emotional challenges (Wolff & de Costa, 2017). Giovanelli (2015) reported that despite feelings of anxiety and low self-confidence, teachers felt that their teaching experience had been a positive one.

This chapter showed several personal factors influencing teacher sub-identities in their narratives. Clearly, who teachers feel themselves to be outside of their professional life is also crucial to their professional identity: gender and sexual orientation are linked to the value teachers perceive in themselves and how they position themselves in the profession; parental experience can be linked to the overall image of the teacher they want to be; and culture, ethnicity, national identity, and political orientation show how teachers define their identity to larger units.

In terms of social networks, these factors can be found in a microsocial environment such as the family of the teacher and a macrosocial environment such as a national state or political party. Negotiation and reconstruction of teacher identity in these non-professional environments might not be as visible as in the classroom, but it might bring deeper understanding of who teachers are.
Discussion: The interplay of personal and professional teachers’ narrative identity

This issue of *Studia Paedagogica* covers the question of the identity construction of teachers. Our research question was: Which factors influence the identity of teachers in published narrative research from 2010 to 2020? What do stories of teachers tell us about their identity construction?

First, we would like to emphasize that our analysis focused only on narrative research in teacher identity; a whole body of research on teacher identity was not within our scope (cf. Alsup, 2019; Schutz et al., 2018). Narrative research on teacher identity does not represent a coherent methodological approach; rather, it is a very diverse methodological practice. Research methods in this field consist of written and spoken narratives represented mainly by in-depth interviews (e.g., Cardelle-Elawar & de Acedo Lizarraga, 2010; Trent, 2017), but these methods are also combined with other methods, such as with participant observation of interviewed teachers (e.g., Prabjandee, 2019). These multi-method approaches might connect teacher identity with teaching practices and demonstrate the importance of teacher identity for classroom discourse and vice versa. Research in this qualitative field of study has in common small samples, even case studies or autobiographical studies (e.g., Schaefer, 2013). To compensate for small samples, in-depth data and longitudinal perspectives are present. To choose a case for a case study, specific criteria are used, e.g. teachers from minorities (ethnicity, race, LGBTQ community) or teachers within a certain phase of professional development or participating within a unique educational program. As a result, teachers from minorities and specific topics regarding teacher identity might be represented while the identity of mainstream teachers with mainstream teaching careers might be underrepresented in this research field. It is complicated to generalize research outcomes, as narrative research presents mainly unique biographies of teachers, but interpretation of the research could be broader. For example, in terms of social networks, the specific story of a Tonga immigrant in New Zealand being mistaken for a cleaner instead of the teacher (Barkhuizen, 2016) might represent the experience of being labeled as different by colleagues and what it means for teacher identity if the teacher “does not fit” into the collectively shared perception of a teacher.

To analyze an extensive body of narrative research on teacher identity, we established two main categories of teacher identity: professional and personal. The title of the text speaks of identity between professional and personal. In the text, both spheres of identity are described separately, because this is the way that research is most often focused on them. In reality, however, these identities interact, as we will suggest at the end of the article.
Within these two categories of identity, several sub-identities emerged. In terms of professional identity, these sub-identities were connected with diversity in classroom discourse, professional development, and curriculum. For personal identities, they were gender, age, sexual orientation, parenting, ethnicity, culture, etc. Although described separately, it is obvious that these two categories of teacher identity interact. Construction of teacher identity might be viewed as a continuous interplay of these identities and sub-identities. As Wagner and Hu (2020) argued, both autobiographical resources (personal identity in our research) and professional identity, including teachers’ specialist knowledge, contribute to their self-positioning. Professional and personal identity can support each other or can be in conflict. An example of synergy between professional and personal identities was in the research by Li et al. (2019), in which the parenting experience of a teacher was mirrored in his teaching practice and deepened his professional reflection. By contrast, conflicts between personal and professional identities might appear in LGBTQ teacher identity (Bracho & Hayes, 2020). For other teachers, the synergy or conflict of sub-identities might work differently. For our theoretical framework, it is important to perceive teacher identity as a result of the interaction of different professional and personal identities. This construction of identity is not finished; rather, it is permanently co-constructed in professional and personal biographies. Regarding the title of this article, teacher identity seems to be a unique quality that lies between personal and professional identity and is also an outcome of their potential synergy or conflict. As we define identity as a relational phenomenon, social networks in personal and professional life represent a field of teachers’ identity construction. One of the key social networks for construction of teachers’ identity seems to be the classroom and particularly classroom discourse.

Several researchers have argued for the importance of a consideration of discourse as critical to a person’s identity (Baxter, 2004; Clarke, 2009; Gee & Gee, 2007). The relationship of identity and classroom discourse is seen as dialectical. This view of identity has implications for pedagogy and classroom discourse and vice versa. Moje and Luke (2009) posited that one way to portray identity is as social practices in which individuals construct their identity through the discourses in which they are engaged. Therefore understanding the construction of identity within an educational context also requires an understanding of the practices (interactional approach to discourse) and beliefs, knowledge, and ideas (critical educational approach to discourse) that people make use of in classroom discourse (cf. Esteban-Guitart & Moll, 2014). On the other hand, classroom discourse is constantly re-shaped by the identities of its participants. For example, code switching within classroom discourse was legitimized by EFL teachers’ non-native speaker identity (Raman & Yiğitoğlu, 2018). Forming teacher identity within
a classroom discourse seems to be a crucial social arena where professional and personal identity interplay.

Besides the classroom discourse and students within, staffroom interactions seem to be important for teacher identity construction. We demonstrated the importance of colleagues and even experts (scientists), partly in an international context. Connelly and Clandinin (1999) stated that who teachers are originates with a knowledge of the narrative history of school stories and of the central “stories to live by” for teachers and others in the school. We add that personal stories of teachers are as important as professional stories, and that narrative research seems to be an option for understanding their connection (cf. Schaefer & Clandinin, 2019).

Sometimes some identities are foregrounded while others are backgrounded, and this foregrounding and backgrounding can be complex. Teacher identities are both personal and professional and are shaped by the contexts in which teachers live and work (Schaefer & Clandinin, 2019). For example, at a social gathering outside work, a teacher might identify more with personal identity (e.g., gender); at an education conference, a teacher might identify more with professional development identity (novice teacher). But this foregrounding and backgrounding of identities is also influenced by how much the various identities interrelate. These different interrelations can be adopted at different times or with different emotional states and can have very different consequences for social interaction (Roccas & Brewer, 2002).

As teacher identity is a crucial tool for teachers and thus a key to understanding and improving classroom practices, our literature review indicates an urgent need for understanding the construction of teacher identity within the broad context of their professional as well as personal lives and their mutual ongoing interaction.

To understand teacher identity, interactions and meanings in social networks in work and life need to be captured in a scope beyond the narrative research of teachers. Identities of principals, parents, and students contribute to a holistic understanding of identity within a school community.

The findings of this literature review were crucial for our research project in the development of research methods (semi-structured interviews captured professional and personal identities) and in the data analysis, where the findings contributed toward the theoretical sensitivity of researchers.

Acknowledgements

This study was funded by the Czech Science Foundation in the project Narrative identities of participants in education at private alternative schools (GA20-12828S).
References


**Corresponding authors**

Kateřina Lojdová
Department of Education, Faculty of Education, Masaryk University, Czech Republic
E-mail: lojdova@ped.muni.cz

Kateřina Vlčková
Department of Education, Faculty of Education, Masaryk University, Czech Republic
E-mail: vlckova@ped.muni.cz

Jan Nehyba
Department of Education, Faculty of Education, Masaryk University, Czech Republic
E-mail: nehyba@ped.muni.cz